

Appendix 1: A Jurisdictional Comparison of Components																																			
JURISDICTION	BRITISH COLUMBIA			ALBERTA			SASKATCHEWAN			NEWFOUNDLAND AND LABRADOR			PRINCE EDWARD ISLAND	MARINE COASTAL AREAS			NORTHWEST TERRITORIES			NUNAVUT			MANITOBA			ONTARIO (Far North)			QUEBEC		YUKON		US DOI BLM		
COMPONENT	Land Use Objectives Regulation (Provincial Legislation)	A New Direction (Provincial Strategy)	Take-BC Framework (Regional)	Provincial Legislation (ALSA)	Provincial Strategy (Alberta Land Use Framework)	Regional (North SK TOR)	Provincial Legislation (For Municipal: Planning and Development Act and Statements of Provincial Interest (Regulations))	Provincial Strategy (The Planning Handbook "for Municipal Planning")	Regional Strategy (Athabasca Planning Region)	Provincial Legislation	Provincial Strategy (land claim agreement)	Provincial Legislation (Planning Act)	Maritime Strategy (A Guide to Land Use Planning in the Coastal Areas of the Maritime Provinces)	Regional Strategy	Territorial Legislation (mackenzie valley resource management act)	Territorial Strategy (Land Use and Sustainability Framework - currently developing a land use planning framework)	Territorial Strategy (Land Use Planning Guidelines)	Regional Strategy (Sattu Meis Land Claim Agreement)	Territorial Legislation (Draft Nunavut planning and project assessment act)	Territorial Strategy (Nunavut Land Claim Agreement)	Provincial Legislation (The East Side Traditional Lands Planning and Protected Areas Act)	Regional Strategy	Provincial Legislation (Far North Act)	Provincial Strategy	Regional Strategy (Pungalsai TOR)	Nunavut Inuit Land Claims Agreement	Regional Strategy (General Bylaw for Nunavik Marine Planning Commission)	Territorial Legislation (Umbrella Final Agreement Ch. 10)	Regional Strategy (Dawson GTOR)	Land Use Planning Handbook					
Planning Objectives	LUC Regulation. Must make business case to be approved by Cabinet for any planning process to occur that is affected by FRPA, SLUP - business cases may be more elaborate.	oversharing vision.	LUC Regulation. Must make business case to be approved by Cabinet for any planning process to occur. SLUP business cases may be more elaborate. Vision and outcomes outlined.	Vision statement and regional outcomes in the ALLUF	Detailed vision and regional outcomes align with ALLUF.		10 general planning practices and 3 desired considerations that detail must be used in planning.	Operational and timeline objectives for creation and responsibilities of advisory panel.			High level objectives.				Planning board to work with minister and FN to develop planning objectives.	as mentioned below in policy direction, there are land interests identified by GNWT	Purpose of land use planning described.		refers to land claim agreement	3 planning objectives identified.	2 objectives in the act related to building relationships with FNs and furthering the development of goals and objectives with FNs.				Vision Statement. Goals of the FN and government stated independently. Joint Objectives.	3 planning objectives	0 objectives from land claim	5 planning objectives.	Purpose of plan written as vision statement, objectives copied from UFA	7 objectives/purpose statements of the handbook. Also references 9 land planning objectives legislated in Federal Lands Planning and Management Act.					
Planning Principles				10 Principles in ALLUF			6 planning principles.	12 principles agreed to by the parties.				7 planning principles plus a large number of recommended principles included in the various sections of resources information and planning tool			A vision statement and description is provided. 7 land use and land management principles.			5 planning principles identified.	refers to land claim agreement	7 guiding principles	7 principles (including voluntary)	3 planning principles			Joint Principles based on stated goals from each party.	1 planning principles.	Not in the Bylaw								
Decision Making Levels and Planning Hierarchy		Government leads. PNC collaborated with PNC committees for each region. Stakeholders are advisory.	Recommendations for making in implementation.	Plan approval described in ALSA	ALLUF describes how decisions will be made. Academic evidence, and will be collaborative and transparent.	Roles and responsibilities described for AB, RAC.		Government and FN have final approval. Technical staff draft. Advisory panel reviews, and takes out for consultation then recommends that parties.			planning authority forwards to government and FN for approval. 60 days to comment or approve plan. Revised if necessary, parties.									NFC authority to create operational bylaws.					described consensus. FN and government will endorse the plan.		deferred to planning process that decisions be made by consensus.	protocols for decision making provided.							
Organizational Structures/Governance		Government leads planning. Collaborates with FN PNC committees established for each region. A Joint Land Forum is established that is G2C and helps to jointly work on issues and consult with stakeholders.		LUS, regional advisory councils, recommended to Minister who takes to leg	LUS, regional advisory councils, recommended to Minister who takes to leg. LUS provides support and directs process. LAC does the planning and consultation.	DM Committee allocates resources, including internal planning teams and provides political direction. LUS provides support and directs process. LAC does the planning and consultation.		Intram advisory Council formed.		council will develop plan.	Planning authority set up by land claim agreement. Minister appointed planning staff. Roles and responsibilities defined.			Gwich'in and Sattu Land Use Boards established.			Detailed description of roles and responsibilities of government departments.	Planning boards to develop plan. Planning board membership.	Nunavut planning commission established with responsibilities detailed. Membership appointments described.	Nunavut planning commission established with responsibilities detailed. Membership appointments described.	Planning Council may be established with members from government and FN.			Purpose of TOR described in context of the FN and government working together collaboratively. Governance structure chart provided. Planning team, and advisory team memberships and responsibilities listed with respect to planning process.	establishment of planning commission. To have the same bylaws as Nunavut Planning Commission.		Establishment of YLUPC as advisory bodies to government and overseers of regional planning in YT, and planning commissions as planning entities. Commissions. Roles and responsibilities listed with respect to planning process.	Detailed description of relationship between commissions, council and parties. Mandate and membership of commission. TORs for TWG and SLC provided.							
Government Policy Direction			outcomes clearly defined in TOR. Government of BC can establish legal and use objectives for the purposes of the FRPA.		Through the 3 planning outcomes the framework details direction wit to healthy economy, environment, and people friendly communities.	More detailed direction may occur at regional level wt environmental, economic, and social. Eg. GoA identifies priority areas to guide land focus the RAC through proposed strategic directions. Cabinet approves content for regional plans before planning begins. A checklist of recommendation areas given to RAC by government.	LUS, 14 statements of Provincial Interest. Each interest includes the interest (as written in the regulations), the context, suggested and common practices, relevant acts, legislation, and policy, and contact information for provincial offices managing issues related to these areas. (e.g. Biodiversity & Natural								provisions allowing minister to provide policy direction to board.	identified land interests that fall into 4 categories. Builds on the vision and principles in this document.				plan components to be addressed in planning process (up to planning body to add additional ones)	Minister can provide direction to planning council on components to be included in management plan. 10 topics of consideration for a management plan are listed in the act.			8 topics to be addressed in strategy	topics listed for inclusion in the strategy	guidance provided on various land use topics.	Areas of focus provided in short for the planning team to consider.	one provision to have plans deal with waste clean up where identified.	General statement on what a regional plan should include, but largely deferred to planning process.	Program and resource specific guidance in 28 detailed categories. Social sciences considerations provided for planning process					
Defining the process						Described in TOR as appendix including steps, activities and deliverable public release documents.		Described in general steps in Agreement						purpose of a plan defined.	purpose and need for plans described.											All steps listed. From setting up th planning team and TORs, information gathering, draft plan.	process described in detail with all planning phases.	Overall general description of planning process.	Many statements that describe what planning should include.	requirements copied from UFA.	flowchart and description of planning process for new plans, plan revisions, and plan				
The Planning Process - Info Collection					Government of AB will provide data for regional planning. Speaks to info mgmt, monitoring and evaluation system, sharing knowledge.			A lot of high level information is provided up front to regional council. Technical staff from government, FN, and industry will gather and provide info. Some field work might happen. Process only. Document does not provide info.									GNWT to help provide info to process.													Described. Commission to gather and analyze information. Parties to assist in provision of information to commission.					
The Planning Process - Issue Identification			wildlife management topics and economic opportunities/ revenue sharing topics			Some issues identified in regional TOR from GoA, identifies that RAC will consult on the TOR and the issues provided by Cabinet.																									Described. Commission to gather and analyze information. Parties to assist in provision of information to commission.				
The Planning Process - Optional						identified as a step and with activities.																									required components.				
The Planning Process - Draft Plan					describes drafting process and consulting on draft.																														
The Planning Process - Final Plan					approved by cabinet becomes official gov policy																														
The Planning Process - Review/Implementation			Outlines recommendations required for effective implementation and a shared decision making process.	YES	every 5 years for amendments. 10 to complete review																														
Planning Regions*	YES			ALLUF		geographic areas with 3 phases of sub-regions delineated for planning over 5 years.	A process set out to delineate a planning region.	Only one regional planning region. Chapter 10 only refers to this one region.	Cabinet may establish planning zones.	Not so much but coastal zones are described in great detail (i.e. inter tidal, salt marshes, etc).					overview of planning regions and existing planning efforts.			NPC to establish planning regions. No overlap.	planning includes land and marine areas. Regions to be established by NPC.	designated under authority of act the minister but by request of FN	planning region identified and mapped.														
overview of planning region					appendix in TOR - like a resource assessment report and in alignment with ALLUF																						overview of the far north and evolution of LUP in far north	yes.							
Land Designation System					general reference to agriculture, rural and urban development areas, transportation and utility corridors, and new areas for industrial development. Also says government will develop a method of identifying thresholds and other indicators of cum	Detailed land use classification system and management intents provided for sub-regions within the planning region.					Cabinet may approve land use and structures within zones.			individual provinces have land use designations or established best management practices (either in policy or legislation) for different coastal types. Municipal bylaws also deal with zoning in coastal areas. Inconsistent across the coastal region. NB has divided the coast into Zones A,B, and C and has identified acceptable activities.																					
Key Components in Plan*																																			
Key Operational Elements		Consistent TORs for each region.																																	
Linkages to Other Resource Management Efforts		Requires alignment with FRPA planning activities.	Points to a number of government and FN strategies and plans to be considered in planning.			subregional or municipal plans must align with regional plans. TOR points to other strategies and plans for consideration.								Does not trump other plans, but mentions to consider other planning efforts in region. Identifies a few.																					
conservation and stewardship					yes																														
cumulative effects working with FN			statement of intent guides planning agreements, jointly developed with FN. Priorities reflect FN interests.	inherent	will adopt cumulative effects approach	yes																													
Public Consultation					online surveys for feedback on recommendations and public/stakeholder consultation.																														
Funding/ time limits*		New Direction Framework identifies time limits. Doesn't specify funding directly but does mention it. Also mentions funding for implementation	Specific provisions for timing and funding and what each party will fund independently or jointly.		GoA will provide.					5 years, 3 phases	10 year plans																								
LEGACY PLANS			With new framework, discusses how to deal with plans completed under the old structure.																																
legal authority for planning																																			
term and renewal of framework																																			
dispute resolution																																			
Indemnification																																			
Interim measures																																			
Non-conforming Uses																																			