

Appendix 1: A Jurisdictional Comparison of Components		BRITISH COLUMBIA			ALBERTA			SASKATCHEWAN			NEWFOUNDLAND AND LABRADOR			PRINCE EDWARD ISLAND		MARINE COASTAL AREAS			NORTHWEST TERRITORIES			NUNAVUT			MANITOBA			ONTARIO (Far North)			QUEBEC		YUKON		US DOI BLM
COMPONENT	Land Use Objectives Regulation (Provincial Legislation)	A New Direction (Provincial Strategy)	Take-BC Framework (Regional)	Provincial Legislation (ALSA)	Provincial Strategy (Alberta Land Use Framework)	Regional (North SK TOR)	Provincial Legislation (For Municipal Planning and Development Act and Statements of Provincial Interest (Regulations))	Provincial Strategy (The Planning Handbook "for Municipal Planning")	Regional Strategy (Athabasca Planning Region)	Provincial Legislation	Provincial Strategy (land claim agreement)	Provincial Legislation (Planning Act)	Maritime Strategy (A Guide to Land Use Planning in the Coastal Areas of the Maritime Provinces)	Regional Strategy	Territorial Legislation (mackenzie valley resource management act)	Territorial Strategy (Land Use and Sustainability Framework - currently developing a land use planning framework)	Territorial Strategy (Land Use Planning Guidelines)	Regional Strategy (Sattu Meis Land Claim Agreement)	Territorial Legislation (Draft Nunavut planning and project assessment act)	Territorial Strategy (Nunavut Land Claim Agreement)	Provincial Legislation (The East Side Traditional Lands Planning and Protected Areas Act)	Regional Strategy	Provincial Legislation (Far North Act)	Provincial Strategy	Regional Strategy (Pungalsai TOR)	Nunavut Inuit Land Claims Agreement	Regional Strategy (General Bylaw for Nunavik Marine Planning Commission)	Territorial Legislation (Umbrella Final Agreement Ch. 10)	Regional Strategy (Dawson GTOR)	Land Use Planning Handbook					
Planning Objectives	LUC Regulation. Must make business case to be approved by Cabinet for any planning process to occur that is affected by FRPA, SLUP - business cases may be more elaborate.	oversharing vision.	LUC Regulation. Must make business case to be approved by Cabinet for any planning process to occur. SLUP business cases may be more elaborate. Vision and outcomes outlined.	vision statement and regional outcomes in the ALLUF	Detailed vision and regional outcomes align with ALLUF.		10 general planning practices that detail considerations that must be used in planning.	Operational and timeline objectives for creation and responsibilities of advisory panel.			High level objectives.			Planning board to work with minister and FN to develop planning objectives.	as mentioned below in policy direction, there are land interests identified by GNWT	Purpose of land use planning described.		refers to land claim agreement	3 planning objectives identified.	2 objectives in the act related to building relationships with FNs and furthering the development of goals and objectives with FNs.				Vision Statement. Goals of the FN and government stated independently. Joint Objectives.	3 planning objectives	0 objectives from land claim	5 planning objectives.	Purpose of plan written as vision statement, objectives copied from UFA	7 objectives/purpose statements of the handbook. Also references 9 land planning objectives legislated in Federal Lands Planning and Management Act.						
Planning Principles				10 Principles in ALLUF			6 planning principles.	12 principles agreed to by the parties.				7 planning principles plus a large number of recommended principles included in the various sections of resources information and planning tool			A vision statement and description is provided. 7 land use and land management principles.		5 planning principles identified.	refers to land claim agreement	7 guiding principles	7 principles (including voluntary)	3 planning principles			Joint Principles based on stated goals from each party.	1 planning principles.	Not in the Bylaw									
Decision Making Levels and Planning Hierarchy		Government leads. FNC collaborated with PMC committees for each region. Stakeholders are advisory.	Recommendations for making in implementation.	Plan approval described in ALSA	ALLUF describes how decisions will be made. Science, evidence, and will be collaborative and transparent.	Roles and responsibilities described for AB, RAC.		Government and FN have final approval. Technical staff draft. Advisory panel reviews, and takes out for consultation. Then recommends that parties.		planning authority forwards to government and FN for approval. 60 days to comment or approve plan. Revised if necessary, parties.									NFC authority to create operational bylaws.					described consensus. FN and government will endorse the plan.		deferred to planning process that decisions be made by consensus.	protocols for decision making provided.								
Organizational Structures/Governance		Government leads planning. Collaborates with FN. PCMC committees established for each region. A Joint Land Forum is established that is G2C and helps to jointly work on issues and consult with stakeholders.	LUS regional advisory councils, recommended to Minister who takes to leg	LUS regional advisory councils, recommended to Minister who takes to leg	DM Committee allocates resources, including internal planning teams and provides political direction. LUS provides support and directs process. LAC does the planning and consultation.	DM Committee allocates resources, including internal planning teams and provides political direction. LUS provides support and directs process. LAC does the planning and consultation.	Intram advisory Council formed.	council will develop plan.	Planning authority set up by land claim agreement. Minister appointed planning staff. Roles and responsibilities defined.					Gwich'in and Sattu Land Use Boards established.	Detailed description of roles and responsibilities of government departments.	Planning boards to develop plan. Planning board membership.	Nunavut planning commission established with responsibilities detailed. Membership appointments described.	Nunavut planning commission established with responsibilities detailed. Membership appointments described.	Planning Council may be established with members from government and FN.						Purpose of TOR described in context of the FN and government working together collaboratively. Governance structure chart provided. Planning team, and advisory team memberships and purpose described.	establishment of planning commission. To have the same bylaws as Nunavut Planning Commission.	Establishment of YLUPC as advisory bodies to government and overseers of regional planning in YT, and planning commissions as planning entities. Commissions. Roles and responsibilities listed with respect to planning process.	Detailed description of relationship between commissions, council and parties. Mandate and membership of commission. TORs for TWG and SLC provided.							
Government Policy Direction		outcomes clearly defined in TOR. Government of BC can establish legal and use objectives for the purposes of the FRPA.		Through the 3 planning outcomes, Minister who takes to leg. Eg. GOA identifies priority areas to guide land focus the RAC through proposed strategic directions. Cabinet approves content for regional plans before planning begins. A checklist of recommendation areas given to RAC by government.	More detailed direction may occur at regional level wt environmental, economic, and social. Eg. GOA identifies priority areas to guide land focus the RAC through proposed strategic directions. Cabinet approves content for regional plans before planning begins. A checklist of recommendation areas given to RAC by government.	List 14 statements of Provincial Interest. Statement of Provincial Interest Regulations of the Planning and Development Act.	14 Statements of Provincial Interest. Each interest includes the interest (as written in the regulations), the context, suggested and common practices, relevant acts, legislation, and policy, and contact information for provincial offices managing issues related to these areas. (e.g. Biodiversity & Natural							provisions allowing minister to provide policy direction to board.	identified land interests that fall into 4 categories. Builds on the vision and principles in this document.				plan components to be addressed in planning council on components to be included in management plan. 10 topics of consideration for a management plan are listed in the act.	Minister can provide direction to planning council on components to be included in management plan. 10 topics of consideration for a management plan are listed in the act.	8 topics to be addressed in strategy (up to planning body to add additional ones)	topics listed for inclusion in the strategy	guidance provided on various land use topics.	Areas of focus provided in short for the planning team to consider.	one provision to have plans deal with waste clean up where identified.	General statement on what a regional plan should include, but largely deferred to planning process.	Program and resource specific guidance in 28 detailed categories. Social sciences considerations provided for planning process								
Defining the process					Described in TOR as appendix including steps, activities and deliverable public release documents.		Described in general steps in Agreement							purpose of a plan defined.	purpose and need for plans described.									All steps listed. From setting up th planning team and TORs, information gathering, draft plan.	process described in detail with all planning phases.	Overall general description of planning process.	Many statements that describe what planning should include.	requirements copied from UFA.	flowchart and description of planning process for new plans, plan revisions, and plan						
The Planning Process - Info Collection				Government of AB will provide data for regional planning. Speaks to info mgmt, monitoring and evaluation system, sharing knowledge.	A lot of high level information is provided up front on regional planning, economic, and environment, and people friendly knowledge. Includes policies, plans, data, reports, etc.		lays in document that info compilation is left to advisory council. Technical staff from government, FN, and industry will gather and provide info. Some field work might happen. Process only. Document does not provide info.							GNWT to help provide info to process.											Detailed description of responsibilities for information sharing.			Described. Commission to gather and analyze information. Parties to assist in provision of information to commission.							
The Planning Process - Issue Identification			wildlife management topics and economic opportunities/ revenue sharing topics		Some issues identified in regional TOR from GOA. Identifies that RAC will consult on the TOR and the issues provided by Cabinet.		Left to Advisory council TOR																			briefly described.									
The Planning Process - Optional					identified as a step and with activities.										GNWT to analyze options															required components.					
The Planning Process - Draft Plan					describes drafting process and consulting on draft.		Development and consultation process described.			Draft process and review.				draft submitted to FN, Territorial Minister, and Federal Minister for approval. FN will notify territorial and federal ministers when they approve	GNWT to review draft. GNWT criteria for reviewing and approving new plans.					Development, consultation, and plan phases described.	Development, consultation, and approval of draft plans described.				Approval Process described in detail	review and amendment provisions.	approval process described	refers to UFA and also describes key components to be included in plan.							
The Planning Process - Final Plan					approved by cabinet becomes official gov policy		Approval process described.	Review and Approval described.		Approval process defined. Accept vary reject...	Cabinet approves final plan or plan policies.									Approval Process described in detail					briefly described.	approval process described	Approval process detailed.	Approval bodies identified.							
The Planning Process - Review/Implementation			Outlines recommendations required for effective implementation and a shared decision making process.	YES	every 5 years for amendments. 10 to complete review		Very basic description. No roles and responsibilities.	Government or a council or combo of two will implement plan. Review to take place not more than 5 years after adoption.		responsibilities for implementation outlined. 5 year reviews.				Planning board to monitor and implement. Amendments at the discretion of planning board. Formal reviews every 5 years.	Detailed description of GNWT implementation process and responsibilities.		same as agreement	plan to include an implementation strategy. Review schedule not identified, but may review or amend periodically.	Process for amendments described		will implement plan if good faith.				review and amendment provisions.	describes variety of different geographical areas associated with planning (i.e. decision areas, planning areas, analysis areas)	Describes implementing plans and defining implementation decisions. Also large section describing monitoring, evaluation and adaptive management.								
Planning Regions*	YES			ALLUF			geographic areas with 3 phases of sub-regions delineated for planning over 5 years.	A process set out to delineate a planning region.	Only one regional planning region. Chapter 10 only refers to this one region.	Cabinet may establish planning zones.		Not so much but coastal zones are described in great detail (i.e. inter tidal, salt marshes, etc).			overview of planning regions and existing planning efforts.			NFC to establish planning regions. No overlap.	planning includes land and marine areas. Regions to be established by NFC.	designated under authority of act of the minister but by request of FN	planning region identified and mapped.			left to the planning commission	deferred to planning process. But endeavour to use traditional territory boundaries. YLUPC establishes.	Provided and described in detail.									
overview of planning region					appendix in TOR... like a resource assessment report and in alignment with ALLUF																			overview of the far north and evolution of LUP in far north	yes.										
Land Designation System					general reference to agriculture, rural and urban development areas, transportation and utility corridors, and new areas for industrial development. Also says government will develop a method of identifying thresholds and other indicators of cum	Detailed land use classification system and management intent provided for sub-regions within the planning region.				Cabinet may approve land use and structures within zones.		individual provinces have land use designations or established best management practices (either in policy or legislation) for different coastal types. Municipal bylaws also deal with zoning in coastal areas. Increment across the coastal region. NB has divided the coast into Zones A,B, and C and has identified acceptable activities.													will provide.										
Key Components in Plan*							Scope of plan and required components is listed.	outlined in detail in legislation	detailed in land claim agreement					List of things the plan can include.						list of items to be included in the plan.					10 required plan components listed.	9 key components to be addressed in a LUP	refers to UFA and also describes key components to be included in plan.	defines types of land use plan decisions (desired outcome aka goals and objectives; and allowable uses). Provides standard formats for land use plan documents.							
Key Operational Elements		Consistent TORs for each region.												regional office locations specified for boards. Record keeping provisions.		planning board office in settlement region.	Nunavut planning commission funded by government. Located in settlement region. NFC power and by-law making authority.	Nunavut planning commission funded by government. Located in settlement region. NFC power and by-law making authority.	Procedures for a council may be developed. No details on what they would include. Public registry established for housing information and	preparation of minutes and documents in a timely fashion.					establishment of PC and office location.	location of office. Official seal on documents. Meetings, appointments, staff.		Operating procedures for commissions listed in detail.							
Linkages to Other Resource Management Efforts		Requires alignment with FRPA planning activities.	Points to a number of government and FN strategies and plans to be considered in planning.		subregional or municipal plans must align with regional plans. TOR points to other strategies and plans for consideration.		Does not trump other plans, but mentions to consider other planning efforts in region. Identifies a few.			NB plans to have their coastal strategy inform and align other resource management policies.			shall consider settlement land use plans.		Government may plan on government land. FN may plan on settlement land. Plans will be considered.		regional and municipal plans must be compatible.			will recognize and integrate other plans where possible.				cooperation between regional and municipal planning authorities. Municipal plans shall implement planning principles of regional plans.		must have links to other plans and process to reduce overlap and redundancy. Should also apply to the process of establishing new parks or historic sites. Discusses sub-		linkages to tribal plans.							
conservation and stewardship					yes															A special section on identifying special protected areas.															
cumulative effects working with FN		statement of intent guides planning agreements, jointly developed with FN. Priorities reflect FN interests.	inherent		will adopt cumulative effects approach	yes				inherent				must involve participation of FN and residents. Must consider and possibly incorporate a FN settlement lands land use plan.		inherent	plan will include inuit owned lands. Planning process must incorporate FN values and objectives. Also must consider TK	inherent in entire act starting with objectives, to members of the planning team, etc. Also must consider TK	consultation with FN		consultation with FN			collaborative and inherent in TOR.		inherent in final agreement.	inherent	Detailed description on government to government coordination and linkages to tribal plans.							
Public Consultation					online surveys for feedback on recommendations and public/stakeholder consultation.		described	consultation should happen	planning authority consults			describes public involvement		public notice to review draft plans. Must consult people in communities.		consultation of draft		must provide for public input. Must also make final plan available to public.	consultation with public. Must also make final plan available to community					FN community and stakeholders to be held in development of plan.	public hearings to be held in development of plan.	deferred to planning process.	Provisions of participation for engagement.	Detailed description of different methods including definitions of coordination, cooperation, consultation, and collaboration.							
Funding/ time limits*		New Direction Framework identifies time limits. Doesn't specify funding directly but does mention it. Also mentions funding for implementation			GOA will provide.			5 years, 3 phases	10 year plans																deadline for completion of plan given.	timeline provided for planning process.	deferred to planning process.	Specifically stated. Provisions provided for more detail.							
LEGACY PLANS			With new framework, discusses how to deal with plans completed under the old structure.																																
legal authority for planning							Detailed list of clauses related to planning.																			The Far north Act states that a LUP Strategy be developed to provide guidance for LUP in the far north.	provided for in the Far North Act	final land use plan identified as a guidance piece for governments. Officials authority for land use rests with existing government							
term and renewal of framework			regional framework to review after 24 months of 36 month discussed.				Handbook updated regularly. How to apply handbook.																						YES						
dispute resolution							Stated no process. Decision rests with Minister and has final say	described																		briefly described.			protest period and process for resolving protests.						
Indemnification			general disclaimer, clarification of indemnification type clauses.																																
Interim measures			for projects, wildlife conservation, special orders, assessments just may happen during planning.				Disposition freeze. Outfitting, recreational cottages, and other interests. Does not include minerals.	outlined in detail																		interim restrictions and prohibition clauses.		all new major developments require completion of community regional land use plan.							
Non-conforming Uses									grandfather clauses																	provisions for conformity and non-conformity with land use plan		provisions for conformity	deferred to planning process in accordance with chapter 12, but government and FN shall use discretion in granting land use interests to conform	Plan conformance sections.					